

- RHC. Oc. —*Historiens occidentaux*, 5 vols., Paris, 1845–95.
 RHF. *Recueil des historiens des Gaules et de la France*, ed. M. Bouquet, et al., 24 vols., Paris, 1738–1904.
 RISS (1). *Reum Italicarum scriptores*, ed. L. A. Muratori, 25 vols., Milan, 1723–51.
 RISS (2). *Reum Italicarum scriptores*, nuova edizione, Città de Castello, Bologna, etc., 1900– (in progress).
 RM. Pilg. R. Röhrich and H. Meisner, *Deutsche Pilgerreisen nach dem heiligen Lande*, Berlin, 1880.
 ROL. *Revue de l'orient latin*, 12 vols., Paris, 1893–1911.
 RS. *Rolls series. Chronicles and memorials of Great Britain and Ireland during the Middle Ages*, published under the direction of the Master of the Rolls. Société des Anciens Textes Français.
 SATF. Société de l'histoire de France.
 SHE. *Société de l'orient latin. Série géographique*, 5 vols., Geneva, 1879–89.
 SOL. T. Tobler and A. Molinier, *Itinera Hiemsolymitana et descriptiones Terrae Sanctae bellis sacris anteriora*, SOL., i–ii, Geneva, 1879–85.
 VZ. R. Valentini and G. Zucchetti, *Codice topografico della città di Roma, Fonti*, 4 vols., Rome, 1940–53.

Notes

Original sources listed in the bibliography are cited by author and/or shortened title. Secondary works listed in the bibliography are cited by author alone. In cases of doubt, the initials OS or SW are used. Works not listed in the bibliography are cited in full. Numbers in the left column refer to pages in this book.

1. Introduction

- 5 English villages and towns: Stubbs, *Charters*, pp. 464–6.
 Henry of Susa: Quoted in G. Le Bras, *Institutions ecclésiastiques de la Chrétienté médiévale*, vol. i, Paris, 1964–5, p. 204.
 6 No strangers in church: O. Dobiache-Rojdestvensky, *La vie paroissiale en France d'après les actes épiscopaux*, Paris, 1911, pp. 87–8.
 Confession once a year: Conc. Lateran (1215), canon XXI, MC. xxii, 1007–10. On its enforcement in France, Conc. Saintes (1280), MC. xxiv, 379–80; and in England, Conc. Exeter (1287), Powicke and Cheney, *Councils*, vol. ii, p. 992.
 Held in public: MC. xxiv, 527. Cf. Powicke and Cheney, *Councils*, vol. ii, p. 144; for fifteenth century, Gerson, *De Officio Pastoris*, ed. Glorieux, vol. v, p. 141.
 Confessional hand-books: e.g. Powicke and Cheney, *Councils*, vol. ii, pp. 220–6. W. A. Pantin, *The English Church in the fourteenth century*, Cambridge, 1955, pp. 270–6.
 7 Prostrate repents: *Misc. S. Mariae Carnotensis* XVII, pp. 533–4.
 Busybodies: 'Visitation returns of the diocese of Hereford in 1397', ed. A. T. Bannister, *EHR*, xlv (1929), pp. 279–89, 444–53, xlv (1930), pp. 92–101, 444–63. Guérin and Céliér (ed.),

- Documents concernant le Poitou*, vol. xxiv, pp. 134-6, 287-9 (nos. 780-1, 836); late fourteenth century.
- John Myrc, *Instructions for parish priests*, ed. E. Peacock, EETS, vol. xxxi, London, 1868, p. 23.
- London lady dying: Benedict, *Mirac. S. Thomae*, II, 42, p. 90.
- 'Curiosity to see...': Wattenbach (ed.), 'Beitrag', p. 605.
- Guilt overcome by travel: Orderic Vitalis, *Hist. Eocl.*, ed. Chibnall, vol. ii, pp. 44-6. Adam of Eynsham, *Vita S. Hugonis*, IV, 2, vol. ii, pp. 7-10. Paul Walther, *Itin.*, pp. 7-8.
- 'Sigos' inspire terror: Gregory of Tours, *De Virtut. S. Martini*, III, 54, p. 645 (darkness). *Vita S. Genovefae*, V, 19, ed. C. Kohler, BEHE, vol. xlviii, Paris, 1881, p. 24; *Vita S. Aridii*, in Mabillon (ed.), *Vet. Anal.*, p. 204 (thunder). Eligius (attrib.), *Homilia*, IX, PL, lxxxvii, 628 (eclipse of moon). Gregory of Tours, *Hist. Francorum*, VI, 14, IV, 31, 51, pp. 284, 164-5, 187 (red sky, eclipse of sun).
- Survival of these fears: Burchardt, *Dea*, XIX, 5, PL, cxi. Guibert, *De Vita Sua*, I, 15, p. 56. *Mirac. S. Benedicti*, VI, 11, pp. 233-6 (death of Robert the Pious). Langland, *Piers Plouman*, B.V, 13-5, pp. 57-8. *Roman de la Rose*, II, 18, 257-18, 468, vol iii, pp. 48-55.
- Evil in the wind: Gregory of Tours, *De Virutibus S. Martini*, III, 16, p. 636. Toussaert, p. 365 (Dunkirk abbey). Delaruelle et al., pp. 831-2 (German Dominicans). Bruno, *Expositio in Ep. ad Ephesianos*, II, PL, cliii, 325. Yvo, *Panormia*, VIII, 68, PL, clxi, 1322.
- Devil in wild animals: Sulpicius Severus, *Vita S. Martini*, XXI, pp. 130-1. Peter the Venerable, *De Mirac.*, I, 14, 18, cols. 877-8, 883-4, etc. Thomas of Monmouth, *Mirac. S. Willelmi*, III, 12, pp. 137-8 (pig at Norwich). Reginald of Durham, *De B. Guthberti Virut.*, XVII, pp. 32-3. Guibert, *De Vita Sua*, I, 21, pp. 81-2.
- Devil as deformed man: Athanasius, *Vita S. Antonii*, V, VI, XXI, XL, XLII, LIII, PG, xxvi, 845-9, 876, 901, 904-5, 920. Cf. Peter the Venerable, *De Mirac.*, I, 8, col. 869 ('parvi et nigerrimi Aethiops specie assumpta'); Orderic, *Hist. Eocl.*, VIII, 17, ed. Chibnall, vol. iv, pp. 242-4, vol. iv, pp. 242-4 ('agnem Aethiopum...nigerrimi cornipedis').
- Dreams: William, *Mirac. S. Thomae*, III, 5, V, 8, pp. 262-4, 381. Benedict, *Mirac. S. Thomae*, I, 13, pp. 44-5. Rackham, p. 85.
- 14 'One night as he lay...': Orderic, *Hist. Eocl.*, III, ed. Chibnall, vol. ii, pp. 42-4.
- 15 'Luxuria' in sculpture: Mâle, pp. 373-6. G. Zarnecki, *Gislebertus, Sculptor of Autun*, N.Y., 1961, pp. 64-5 and pl. iv.
- 'The cause that oghte...': *Canterbury Tales*, p. 575.
- 16 'Conversion' by preachers: Jacques de Vitry, *Exempla*, CXCIX, p. 83. Etienne de Bourbon, *Antedotes* I, 21, p. 29 (Bologna student); cf. Owst, p. 413 and n³. Caesarius, *Dial. Mirac.*, I, 6, 16, 18, 21, 25, 29-30, 5, vol. i, pp. 12-15, 22-3, 25, 28, 30-1, 35, II. Augustine's 'conversion': P. Brown, *Augustine of Hippo*, London, 1967, pp. 106-7.
- 'Conversion' in hagiography: Bede, *Hist. Eocl.*, IV, 5, p. 350; Du Cange, vol. ii, pp. 547. See, in general, D. Baker, 'Vir Dei: secular sanctity in the early tenth century', in Cuming and Baker, pp. 40-1.
- 17 Majority damned: Bernard, *Sermo in Vigilia Nativitatis Domini*, III, 3, PL, clxxxii, 96. Berthold, *Predigten*, XXIV, vol. I, p. 382. Herolt, quoted in Coulton, vol. i, p. 447. See references in A. Michel, 'Elus (Nombre des)', DTC., iv, 2364-6.
- Priest's vision: Orderic, *Hist. Eocl.*, VIII, 17, ed. Chibnall, vol. iv, pp. 236-50.
- How far this view accepted: Coulton, vol. i, p. 71 (prior of Holy Trinity). Vincent of Beauvais, *Speculum Morale*, Douai, 1624, col. 840. Berthold, *Predigten*, XXIV, vol. i, p. 386. C. Douais (ed.), *Documents pour servir a l'histoire de l'inquisition dans le Languedoc*, vol. ii, Paris, 1900, p. 100. *Book of Margery Kempe*, I, 59, pp. 144-6.
- 18 Descriptions of Hell: Owst, pp. 522, 524 (sermons). Bede, *Hist. Eocl.*, V, 12, pp. 490-4. Felix, *Life of St. Guthlac*, ed. B. Colgrave, Cambridge, 1956, p. 105. Guibert, *De Vita Sua*, I, 18, p. 70. Caesarius, *Dial. Mirac.*, I, 34, vol. i, pp. 39-43 (Landgrave Ludwig). *Visio Monachi de Eynsham*.
- 20 Salvation a miracle: Berthold, *Predigten*, XXIV, vol. i, p. 382. Theofrid of Epternach, *Flores Eptiphonium Sanctorum*, I, 3, col. 384.
2. The Cult of Relics
- 21 Victorius on saints: *De Laude Sanctorum*, XII, PL, xx, 454-5. Early evidence of cult of relics: Eusebius, *Hist. Eocl.*, IV, 15, pp.

- 350-2 (Polycarp). Prudentius, *Peristephanon*, V. 41-5, p. 346 (St. Vincent) *Monumenta Ecclesiae Liturgica*, ed. F. Cabrol, vol. 1 (2), Paris, 1900, p. 192 (nos. 4399-4401).
- 22 Jerome and Vigilantius: Jerome, *Contra Vigilantium*, cols. 346-8; *Ep.* CIX. 1, vol. ii, pp. 351-3. Cf. Augustine, *De Civitate Dei*, XXII. 9-10, vol. ii, pp. 613-15.
- Cult of relics defended: Augustine, *op. cit.*, 1. 13, VIII. 17, 27, vol. i, pp. 25-6, 382-3, 405; *Contra Faustianum*, XXI. 21, *PL* xlii. 384. Followed by Isidore of Seville, *De Ecclesiasticis Officialibus*, xxxv. 1-6, *PL* lxxxiii. 770.
- 23 Popular view: Cyprian, *Epp.* XIII. 5, LXXVI. 2, ed. W. von Hartel, *CSEL* iii, Vienna, 1868-71, vol. i, pp. 507, 829. Cyril of Jerusalem, *Catechesis*, XVIII. 16, XIX. 16, XIX. 7, *PG*. xxxiii. 1071. See Delehaye (4), p. 116.
- Aquinas on relics: *Summa Theologiae*, III, q. xxv, a. 6, vol. xi, p. 284.
- 24 *Branda*: Cyril of Jerusalem, *loc. cit.* Gregory I, *Reg.* V. 57, vol. i, p. 364; *Dialogues*, II. 38, *PL* lxxvi. 204.
- 'He who wishes to pray': Gregory of Tours, *In Gloria Martyrum*, XXXVII, pp. 503-4.
- 25 Gregory of Tours at Brioude: *De Virtut. S. Juliani*, XXXIV-XXXV, pp. 578-9.
- Dust from Holy Land: Frolow, pp. 158-9 (funerary table). Augustine, *De Civitate Dei*, XXII. 8, vol. ii, pp. 602-3. Gregory of Nyssa, *De S. Theodoro*, *PG*. xlv. 740.
- 26 Hung round neck: Gregory I, *Reg.* III. 33, vol. i, p. 192. Jerome, *Comm. in Evang. S. Matthaei*, IV, *PL*. xxvi. 168. Conc. III Bracarense, canon V, in *PL*, lxxxiv. 589-90. Aquinas, *Summa Theologiae*, II, ii, q. xcvi, a. 4, vol. ix, pp. 334-5. Adam, *Vita S. Hugonis*, vol. ii, pp. 167-8.
- Later use of *branda*: Guibert, *De Vita Sua*, III. 18, p. 219. *Mirac. S. Michaelis*, pp. 880, 883. Faber, *Evagatorium*, vol. i, p. 94. Ghistele, *Voyage*, vol. xxxvii, p. 742.
- 27 Fourth-century 'inventions': Delehaye (4), pp. 75-8, 80-1 (Gervaise and Protasius, Stephen), Paulinus, *Vita S. Ambrosii*, XXXIX, *PL*. xiv. 37 (Vitalis and Agricola). Marcellinus, *Chron.*, *PL*. li. 928 (John the Baptist); on the date of this, see *Acta*, Ss. June, vol. iv, p. 713.
- 28 Augustine on dreams: see P. Courcelle, *Les Confessions de Saint Augustin dans la tradition littéraire*, Paris, 1963, pp. 127-33. E. van der Meer, *Augustine the bishop*, London, 1961, pp. 531-9.
- Relics authenticated by dreams: Glaber, *Hist.*, IV. 3, pp. 96-8 (Moses' rod). Raymond of Aguilers, *Hist. Francorum*, X-XI, pp. 253-7 (Holy Lance).
- Sinful to ignore dreams: e.g. *Acta S. Fulconis*, II-V. *Acta*, Ss. May, vol. v, p. 193.
- Jean de Meung on dreams: *Roman de la Rose*, II: 18257-64, vol. iii, p. 48.
- 29 Heads of the Baptist: Delehaye (4), pp. 82-3. *Acta*, Ss. June, vol. iv, pp. 722-46, 751-66.
- Dreams criticized: Conc. Carthage, canon XIV, in *MC*. iii. 971. Augustine, *De Cura pro Mortuis Gerenda*, X, pp. 639-41. Guibert, *De Pignoribus*, 1, 3, col. 624; elsewhere, he suggests that both were false, *Gesta Dei per Francos*, 1. 5, p. 132.
- Guibert on translations: *Gesta Dei*, *loc. cit.*
- 30 Translations in Greek Church: *Codex Theodosianus*, IX. 17, ed. I. Mommsen and P. Meyer, Berlin, 1905, p. 463. Delehaye (4), pp. 54-7.
- Popes refuse to translate relics: Hormisdas, *Ep.* LXXVII, in Thiel (ed.), *Epp. Pontificum*, pp. 874-5. Gregory I, *Reg.* IV. 30, vol. i, p. 264.
- Dismemberment: Theodoret, *Graecarum Affectionum Qualitas*, VIII, col. 1012. Victricius, *De Lande Sanctorum*, XI, col. 453. Gregory of Tours, *Hist. Francorum*, VII. 31, pp. 311-12. Baudonivius, *Vita Radegundis*, II. 15, *PL*. lxxii. 672.
- 31 Austerities before removing relic: Gregory of Tours, *In Gloria Martyrum*, XIII, pp. 497-8. Cosmas of Prague, *Chron. Boemorum*, II. 3-4, ed. D. Bretholz, *MGH. Res. Germ.*, N.S. ii, Berlin, 1923, pp. 84-90. Jocelyn of Brakelond, *Chron. de Rebus Gestis Sansonis*, ed. H. E. Butler, London, 1949, pp. 112-14.
- 32 Relics needed to consecrate churches: Ambrose, *Ep.* XXI, *PL*. xvi. 1019. Bede, *Hist. Eccl.*, 1. 29, p. 104 ('all things needed...'). Conc. Nicaea, session VII, canon VII, in *MC*. xiii. 427; cf. Hefele, vol. iii, pp. 781-2.
- 33 Relics acquired in Rome: Llewellyn, pp. 183-90.
- Byzantine collection: William of Tyre, *Hist.*, XX. 23, p. 985 (Armaury). In general, see Ebersolt. On its dispersal in 1204, Riant (f).

- 34 Other collections: Bethel, p. 69 (Reading); Morand, pp. 9, 23, and preuves, pp. 7-9 (Ste. Chapelle). In general, Fichtenau. Objects of national pride: S Runciman, *The Emperor Romanus Lecapenus and his reign*, Cambridge, 1929, pp. 145, 229-30. William of Malmesbury, *Gesta Pontificum*, V. 268, p. 425. French monk quoted in Fichtenau, p. 72. Matthew Paris, *Chron. Majora*, vol. iv, p. 642 (Suffield).
- 35 Ferdinand of Carrion: *Vita B. Zoyli*, IV, ES. x. 495. Early relic merchants: Delehaye (8), p. 200. Gregory of Tours, *Hist. Francorum*, VII. 31, pp. 311-12.
- 36 Deusdona: Einhard, *Translatio Marcellini et Petri*, I. 3, p. 241; Rudolph, *Mirac. Sanctorum in Fuldenses Ecl. Translationum*, II, p. 330. Emma: Eadmer, *Hist. Novorum*, ed. M. Rule, R.S., London, 1884, p. 108; William of Malmesbury, *Gesta Pontificum*, V. 263, p. 419. Effect of sack of Constantinople: Conc. Lateran, canon LXII, in MC. xxii. 1050-1. Riant (1), p. 8 (d'Alluye). Rohault de Fleury, pp. 110, 396 (Baldwin).
- Einhard: see his *Translatio Marcellini et Petri*, I. 2-5, pp. 240-2. Relics stolen in teeth: Etheria, *Peregr.*, XXXVII. 2, p. 88 (in 385). *Gesta Consulum Andegavorum*, p. 91. *Mirac. S. Eadmundi* (Bod. 240), vol. i, pp. 373-4.
- 37 No property of a relic: see example quoted in Baynes, p. 170. Theft of St. Benedict: Adrevald, *Hist. Translationis S. Benedicti*, in *Mirac. S. Benedicti*, pp. 1-14. Oldest account (late seventh century?) in Mabillon (ed.), *Vet. Anal.*, pp. 211-12.
- 38 Theft of St. Nicholas: Nicephorus, *Translatio S. Nicolai in Barum*, IV-XL, pp. 170-89, esp. pp. 175, 178-9.
- 39 Saint has mind of his own: *Mirac. S. Benedicti*, I. 15-17, pp. 37-42. *Translatio Reliquiarum B. Emiliani*, VIII, ES. I. 368-9. *Guide*, VIII, p. 46.
- 41 St. Hugh at Fécamp: Adam, *Vita S. Hugonis*, vol. ii, pp. 169-70. Precautions against theft: Conc. Lateran, canon LXII, MC. xxii. 1049; Conc. Bordeaux, canon IX, MC. xxiv. 283. *Capitula de Mirac. S. Cuthberti*, VII. II, pp. 258-9 (Durham). *Cartulaire de N-D de Chartres*, ed. E. de Lepinois and L. Merlet, vol. i, Chartres, 1862, p. 61. Pero Tafur, *Audanzas*, p. 29.
- 42 Henry III and blood of Christ: Matthew Paris, *Chron. Maj.*, vol. iv, p. 643, vol. vi, pp. 138-44.

- Guibert on false relics: *De Pignoribus*, I. 2, II. 4, cols. 621, 628-9. Cf. Caesarius, *Dial. Mirac.*, VIII. 69-70, vol. ii, p. 140.
- 43 Odo of Bayeux: Guibert, *op. cit.*, I. 3, col. 625. Fulbert of Cambrai: *Vita Auberti Ep. Cameracensis*, IV. 30-2, ed. J. Ghesquierus, *Acta Sanctorum Belgii*, vol. iii, Bruxelles, 1785, pp. 562-3.
- 44 Dispute over St. Benedict: Peter the Deacon, *Historia Relatio*, I. 1, p. 288; Chamard, pp. 6-12. Cf. *Mirac. S. Benedicti*, VII. 15, pp. 272-4.
- Dispute over St. Nicholas: Orderic, *Hist. Ecl.*, VII. 13, ed. Chibnall, pp. 70-2 (Venosa, Noron). F. Chamard, *Les vies des saints personnages de l'Anjou*, vol. i, Paris, 1863, pp. 411-16; cf. GC. xiv. 473 (Angers). *Hist. de Translatione S. Nicolai*, X-XXIX, RHC. Oct. v. 260-70 (Venice).
- Indignation of the Guide: *Guide*, VIII, pp. 46, 52.
- Mary Magdalene: Saxer, pp. 65-73, 185-7, 230-42.
- 46 Relics displayed when authenticity doubted: *Defectio Corporis S. Dionysii*, II-IX, pp. 166-9 (in c. 1050). Robert de Torigny, *Chron.*, vol. ii, p. 136; Rigord, *Gesta Philippi*, LXXX, vol. i, pp. 114-15 (in 1186).
- Secretly inspected first: Suger, *De Admin. Sua*, XXXIII, p. 203. Inspection of St. Genevieve: *Vita S. Willelmi Roschildensis*, II. 22-4, 4a. Ss. April, vol. i, p. 629; GC. viii. 1450-5.
- 48 Trial by miracle; *MGH. Epp.* v. 338 (St. Felix). Eadmer, *De Sanctorum Veneratione*, V, pp. 362-3 (St. Ouen).
- Trial by fire: *De S. Adalberto Diacono*, XXV, 4a. Ss. OSB. iii. 635-6 (St. Celsus). *Chron. Mon. Casinensis*, II. 33, p. 649. *Vita Meinwerki*, CCIX, ed. F. Tenckhoff, *MGH. Ret. Germ.*, Hannover, 1921, p. 122. Guibert, *De Vita Sua*, III. 20, pp. 230-1 (St. Arnoul). Conc. II Saragossa (An. 592), MC. x. 471 (Arian relics). William of Malmesbury, *Gesta Pontificum*, V. 267, pp. 424-5; *Capitula de Mirac. S. Cuthberti*, VII. 7-11, pp. 254-9 (Anglo-Saxon relics). Mabillon (ed.), *Vet. Anal.*, p. 569 (Anna Gonzaga).
- ### 3. The Saints and Their Relics
- 50 Saints punish mockers: Gerald, *Itin. Cambriae*, I. 2, vol. vi, p. 27. William of Malmesbury, *Gesta Pontificum*, V. 275, pp. 438-9. Orderic, *Hist. Ecl.*, VI. 10, ed. Chibnall, vol. iii, p. 318 (St.

Evroul). *Mirac. S. Emmerammi*, II. 20, *AA. SS. Sept.*, vol. vi, p. 500. Loomis, pp. 98-100 (woman displays posterior, and other examples).

- 51 Iconoclasm in the west: Claudius of Turin, *Adv. Theodulminum Abbatem*, *PL*, cv. 462; *Ep. XII*, in *MGH. Epp.* iv. 611; Hefele, vol. iv, pp. 43-9. See Séjourné, cols. 2353, 2355.
- 52 Eastern heretics in Spain: *ES. x*. 525-32, xv. 12-15. Cf. Conc. Seville (An. 619), canon XII, in *MC. x*. 556.
- Guibert: See Lefranc, p. 298, for comparison with Calvin etc. But there are more sensible assessments in J. Chaurand, 'La conception de l'histoire de Guibert de Nogent', *Cahiers de Civilisation Médiévale*, viii (1965), pp. 381-95; and in Morris. His pamphlet: *De Pignoribus*, esp. I. 3, II. 1-6, III. 3, 5, cols. 624-5, 629-50, 659-60, 662-3. On the relics of Nogent, *De Vita Sua*, II. 1, p. 105. On the Holy Lance, *Gesta Dei der Francos*, VII. 34, p. 252. Accepts cult of genuine relics, *De Pignoribus*, I. 3, col. 625; but demands higher standard of proof, *ibid.*, I. 3-4, cols. 623-4, 627-8.
- 54 Guibert and the inner life: see his *Liber quo ordine sermo fieri debeat*, *PL*, clvi. 27; *De Pignoribus*, I. 2, IV. 8, cols. 619, 678-9. In general, Morris, pp. 59-60.
- 55 'Crystallized into images': Huizinga, p. 136. But the tendency was not, of course, peculiar to the later Middle Ages. Eucharistic images: Early examples in *Vita S. Basilii*, VII, *PL*, lxxiii. 301-2; and *Vitae Patrum*, V. 18, *PL*, lxxiii. 979. *Vita S. Gregorii*, IV. 19, *AA. SS. March*, vol. ii, p. 134: the passage is a late interpolation, see H. Grisar, 'Die Gregorbiographie des Paulus Diakonus in ihrer ursprünglichen Gestalt', *Zeitschrift für katholische Theologie*, xi (1887), p. 160.
- 56 Later examples: Guibert, *De Pignoribus*, I. 2, cols. 616-17; Peter the Venerable, *De Mirac.*, I. 1, col. 852; Jacques de Vitry, *Exempla*, CCLXX, p. 113. Coulton, vol. i, pp. 109-10 (priests manuals). On late mediæval Netherlands, see J. Wils, *Het Sakrament van Mirakel berustende in Sint Jakobs te Leuven*, Louvain, 1905. 'Extracts from Lincoln episcopal visitations', ed. E. Peacock, *Archæologia*, xlvi (1885), pp. 252-3 (George Carter). Immaculate conception and Trinity literally portrayed: Inventory of 1420 in L. E. de Laborde, *Les Dios de Bourgogne*, vol. ii, Paris, 1851, p. 264. Gerson, *Sermon: Puer Natus*, ed. Glorieux, vol. vii, p.

963. J. Sarrête, 'Vierges ouvertes, Vierges ouvrantes, et la Vierge ouvrante de Palau del Vidre', *Ruscino, Revue d'Histoire et d'Archéologie du Roussillon*, ii (1912), pp. 5-59, 449-57.

- 57 Theological scruples on relics of Christ: Aquinas, *Summa Theologica*, III, q. liv, a. 2, vol. xi, pp. 509-10. Innocent III, *De Sacro Altaris Mysterio*, IV. 30, *PL*, ccxvii. 876-7.
- Relics of Christ at Rome: John the Deacon, *Descriptio*, XIII, pp. 356-7; Innocent III, *loc. cit.* Bridget, *Rev.*, VI. 112, p. 525, *AS. SS. Jan.*, vol. i, pp. 4-6.
- 58 Foreskin at Charroux: Montsabert (ed.), *Chartes*; see also Vignerat. At a diocesan synod in 1862, Mgr. Pie asserted that there could be 'no legitimate doubt about the authenticity of this quite unique relic', see P. Sainyves, *Les reliques et les images légendaires*, Paris, 1912, pp. 181-4. Other foreskins: *GC. viii* (Instr.), p. 389 (Coulombs). Demiflé, vol. i, p. 167n. (Boulogne). *AA. SS. Jan.*, vol. i, pp. 6-8 (Antwerp).
- Blood of Christ at Mantua: *Annales Regni Francorum*, p. 119. Herman of Reichenau, *Chron. MGH. SS.* v. 127.
- Bleeding images in Netherlands: L.-J. Rogier, *Geschiedenis van het Katholisme in Noord-Nederland*, vol. i, Amsterdam, 1945, p. 82; cf. Moreau, vol. iv, pp. 368-71.
- Other bleeding images: Aquinas, *Summa Theologica*, III, q. liv, a. 2, vol. xi, pp. 509-10. *Chartularium Universitatis Parisiensis*, ed. H. Denifle and A. Chatelain, vol. iv, Paris, 1897, pp. 682-3 (no. 2634), on blood at La Rochelle. On bleeding images reported in Naples in 1972, see *The Times*, 22 August, 1972, p. 5.
- 60 Blood defended by Grosseteste: Matthew Paris, *Chron. Maj.*, vol. vi, pp. 138-44.
- and by Franciscans: Wadding, *An.* 1351 (nos. 16, 18, 21), *An.* 1462 (nos. 1-18), *An.* 1463 (nos. 1-4), *An.* 1464 (nos. 1-6), vol. viii, pp. 59-62, vol. xiii, pp. 206-16, 264-6, 340-3. N. Glassberger, *Chron., Analecta Franciscana*, ii (1887), pp. 393-5.
- 61 Bruges processions: Toussaert, pp. 259-66.
- Hus on blood of Christ: *De Sanguini Christi*, XI. 38, pp. 28-9. Monstrances and tabernacles: M. Andrieu, 'Réliquaires et monstrances eucharistiques', *An. Boll.* lxxviii (1950), p. 398. Delaruelle *et al.*, pp. 749-52. Fécamp: Baudri de Deuil in *Naustris Pia*, ed. A. du Monstier, Rouen, 1663, p. 232. *Poème sur le Précieux Sang*, II. 12-15, in Kajava (ed.), *Études*, p. 95.

- 62 Peacock on relics: *Repressor*, II, 4, 8, pp. 155, 182. Miracles at Bobbio: *Mirac. S. Columbani Bobbiensis*, I, p. 998. Hair of B. V. M. at Coutances: John of Coutances, *Mirac. Ecl. Constantiensis*, XXII, p. 378. Some *brandea*, usually of eastern origin, are found earlier, see Beissel (2), pp. 296-7.
- 63 Other Hair of B. V. M.: Herman, *Mirac. S. Mariae Laudunensis*, II, 1, col. 973 (Laon). On the hair at Astorga and Boulogne, Mabillon (ed.), *Vet. Andl.*, p. 433; Lambert of Ardres, *Chron. Comitum Ghisnensium*, MGH, SS. xxiv. 577; Gaiffier (2), p. 79. On hair in Germany, Beissel (2), p. 293n¹. Tunics of B. V. M.: *Mirac. S. Mariae Carnotensis*, I, p. 509. *Gesta Episcoporum Virdunensium*, XVIII, MGH, SS. iv. 44. Others are known from dedication records, MGH, SS. XV. 1073, 1095, 1097, 1098, 1270. Relics of S. Maria Maggiore: John the Deacon, *Descriptio*, XIV, p. 359. Milk of B. V. M.: M. Gomez-Moreno, 'El Arca Santa de Oviedo documentada', *Archivo Espanol de Arte*, xviii (1945), p. 129. *Notae Svevigo-Monasterienses*, MGH, SS. xv. 1073. William of Malmesbury, *Gesta Regum*, III, 285, p. 341 (Chartres). B. V. M. 'localized': *Mirac. S. Mariae Carnotensis*, XVIII, pp. 537-8. *Miracles de Rocamadour*, praefat., p. 63. John of Coutances, *Mirac. Ecl. Constantiensis*, VI, pp. 370-2. More, *Dyalogue*, fol. 22. For similar attitudes in modern Italy, see E. C. Banfield, *The moral basis of a backward society*, Glencoe, Illinois, 1958, pp. 130-1n. Saint present in his shrine: *Mirac. S. Beneficij*, II, 19, pp. 123-5. *Mirac. S. Columbani*, XXII, p. 1008. On the Canterbury glass, Rackham, p. 91 and colour pl. XII. Relics on altar: E. Bishop, *Liturgica Historica*, Oxford, 1918, pp. 25-6.
- 66 Statue-reliquaries: *Mirac. S. Fidis*, I, 13, 28, 30, II, 4, pp. 46-7, 71-3, 75-6, 100-1. P. Deschamps, 'Etude sur la Renaissance de la sculpture en France à l'époque romane', *Bulletin Monumentale*, lxxxiv (1925), pp. 33-5. Mâle, p. 203.
- 67 Artistic representations of saints influence popular imagination: Guibert, *De Vita Sua*, I, 16, p. 61. *Mirac. S. Fidis*, I, 1, pp. 9-10. *Chron. Mon. Casinensis*, II, 34, p. 650 ('illa nimirum specie qua depingi a pictoribus consuevit'). On St. Foy and the blind, *Mirac. S. Fidis*, I, 1-2, 29, II, 1, 3, III, 6, 9, 11-12, 14, IV, 15, pp. 6-21, 73, 90-3, 98-9, 137-8, 144-5, 147-50, 152-3, 200-1.

- 68 Influence of popular piety: it will be seen that I differ on this point from G. Duby, 'The diffusion of cultural patterns in feudal society', *Past and Present*, no. 39 (1968), pp. 3-5.

4. The Pursuit of the Miraculous

- 69 Hume: *An Essay on Miracles*, in *An Enquiry concerning human understanding*, ed. L. A. Selby-Bigge, Oxford, 1894, pp. 114, 115-6.
- 70 Injunctions of 1536: in *Letters of Thomas Cromwell*, ed. R. B. Merriman, vol. II, Oxford, 1902, p. 28. Fraud alleged: Hus, *De Sanguine Christi*, XIV, 45-6, pp. 32-3. More, *Dyalogue*, I, 14, fols. 18-18^{vo}. Historic contraptions: H. Ellis (ed.), *Original letters illustrative of English history*, 3rd. series, vol. III, London, 1846, p. 168. *Letters and Papers*, vol. XIII (1), p. 120 (no. 348). Plague at Melrose: *Vita S. Cariberti*, IX, p. 184.
- 73 Augustine of Canterbury and miracles: Bede, *Hist. Ecl.*, I, 26, 30, II, see pp. 76, 108, 190. Gregory I, *Reg.*, XI, 36, vol. II, pp. 305-8. On this, 15, Colgrave.
- 74 St. Martin: Sulpicius Severus, *Dialogi*, II, 4, pp. 184-5. MGH, *Epp.* III, 119-22 (Nizier). Augustine on miracles: *De vera religione*, XXV, 47, PL, xxxiv, 142; *Sermo CCCLVI*, 7, PL, xxxix, 1577. See D. P. de Vooght, 'Les Miracles dans la vie due Saint Augustin', *Recherches de Théologie Ancienne et Médiévale*, xi (1939), pp. 5-16; P. Brown, *Augustine of Hippo*, London, 1967, pp. 384-6.
- 75 Gregory on miracles: *Homilia in Ewang.*, XXIX, PL, lxxvi, 1215. Bede on miracles: *Vita S. Cuthberti*, XXI, p. 224. Orderic on miracles: *Hist. Ecl.*, V, 4, VI, 1, ed. Chibnall, vol. III, pp. 8, 214. Survival of missionary attitude to miracles: Gregory of Tours, *In Gloria Martirum*, LXXX, pp. 542-3; cf. *In Gloria Confessorum*, XIV, p. 756. Caesarius, *Dial. Mirac.*, V, 18, vol. I, pp. 296-7 (Besançon heretics). Pierre de Vaux-de-Cernay, *Hystoria Albigensis*, II, 54, ed. P. Guébin and E. Lyon, *SHE*, vol. I, Paris, 1926, pp. 47-9; cf. Guillaume de Puylaurens, *Chronicon*, IX, ed. Beissier, *Bibliothèque de la Faculté des Lettres de Paris*, XVIII, Paris, 1904, p. 128; the painting is in the Louvre.