

and work as though (or because) everything depends upon you." I cannot find this saying in Augustine; but it reflects his view of the relation of God's grace to human action in response to grace as expressed in his anti-Pelagian writings. Our good works truly "merit" the crown of glory; but at the same time our merits are themselves God's gifts. "In crowning our merits, God is crowning nothing else but God's gifts." ("Quod est meritum hominis ante gratiam . . . cum omne bonum meritum nostrum non in nobis faciat nisi gratia et cum Deus coronat merita nostra, nihil autem coronat quam munera sua?" Augustine, *Epistole CXCIV* [to Sixtus, Roman presbyter, later Pope], PL 33, 880.) Hence we are truly responsible for our salvation. At the same time, Augustine points insistently to God's initiative even in our response to grace.

This was the standard teaching of the High Scholastics as well, and is an extension of the concept of God's transcendental causality as the source of all "secondary" causes in the world. Hence strictly speaking there is no "collaboration," in the sense that God does part and humanity does part. Rather, God is (on the transcendental level of "primary" causality) the *entire* cause of existence and of salvation; and humanity (or other causes) are, on their level of secondary causality, the *entire* cause of whatever they effect. (Note that this Scholastic position allows the methodological independence of empirical science). As Rahner reexpresses the Thomist position, divine causality and human causality are directly, not inversely related. The more free and responsible we are, the more "being" we "have," the more we are caused by God and participate in the divine gift of being. The idea of "dual" justification seems to be a less philosophically sophisticated version of the idea of transcendental causality. In juxtaposing the two levels of action, it carries the danger of conceiving of "God" as a being alongside other beings in the world, forgetting what Heidegger called the "ontological difference" between Being and beings and, even more, the transcendental distinction between God and creation.

11. Michelangelo Buonarroti, *Rime*, basata sul testo critico di Girardi Basata sul testo critico di Girardi (Bari: Universale Laterza, 1967), libro IV, no. 285. The translation is mine.

12. Nagel, *Michelangelo*, 180.

13. Vittoria Colonna, *Pianto sopra la Passione di Christo*, quoted in Nagel, *Michelangelo*, 180.

14. An illustration of the scene of Christ teaching Mary about his coming passion, with a lengthy text shown coming from the mouth of each, is found in a fifteenth century Valencian manuscript in the Richelieu collection of the Bibliothèque Nationale Française (<http://gallica.bnf.fr>). This tradition of course conflicts with another according to which Mary even at the foot of the cross did not understand what was happening, and had to be restrained in her lamenting by Christ's dialogue with her from the cross itself.

15. Nagel, *Michelangelo*, 181.

16. Colonna, *Pianto*, quoted in Nagel, *Michelangelo*, 263n34.

17. *Ibid.*, 184.

18. "Cosi la Madonna vedendo che non vi era la beata anima de Christo, qual era sufficiente ad honorar l'immensa grandezza de la divinita, li pareva che a lei

sola appartenesse el grand'offitio de supplire a tanto debito, onde havria voluto li quefarsi, consumarsi anzi farsi ultima nel fuoco del'amore et ne le lacrime de la compassione per toglier al mondo et a se stessa l'ingratitude, et render a Dio lo ossequio et il colto che li convenia," *Pianto*, quoted in Nagel, *Michelangelo*, 274 n. 58.

My translation differs somewhat from Nagel's. He calls this passage a "curious conclusion" to be drawn by Colonna. Indeed it would be very curious if she espoused a purely "Lutheran" position in which Christ alone is the whole and sole agent of salvation, to the entire exclusion of others, or if, like Luther, she was suspicious of the use of affective meditation on the passion as being connected to a theology of "works." But it seems to me that it is quite in line with the tradition of *compassio* referred to by Colonna herself. Affective meditation on the passion leads to a desire to share in Christ's redemptive work. This is especially true of Mary, but applies also to others as well. Mary indeed becomes the model for our response. We find similar ideas in Savonarola, John of the Cross, Teresa of Avila, etc., and even implicitly in the Pauline passage quoted by Cajetan against Luther: "I make up for what is lacking to the passion of Christ in my flesh . . ." [Col. 1:24] that was an inspiration for so much Passion mysticism.

19. Colonna, *Rime*, quoted in Nagel, *Michelangelo*, 167. The last line reads literally "with his bright light (*lume*)." I have taken "light" here to mean the eyes, as *lumen* frequently did in literary Latin.

20. See for example John C. Olin, *Catholic Reform: From Cardinal Ximenes to the Council of Trent, 1495-1563* (New York: Fordham University Press, 1990).

21. The remaining books of the Bible were printed from 1513-1517, though only published in 1522.

22. For the text of Egidio's discourse, see "Egidio da Viterbo's Address to the Fifth Lateran Council, 1512," in John C. Olin, *The Catholic Reformation: Savonarola to Ignatius Loyola. Reform in the Church 1495-1540* (New York: Harper & Row, 1969), 40-53.

23. The proper name of the order was the "Congregation of Clerks Regular of the Divine Providence." The name "Theatines" derived from the diocese of Theate (Chieti), of which Carafa then bishop.

24. Ignatius of Loyola, *Constitutiones Societatis Iesu*, "Prima Summa" (1539), in *Monumenta Historica Societatis Iesu. Monumenta Ignatiana*. III. (Rome: 1934-1936), 1: 16-20.

25. *Canones et Decreta Sacrosancti Oecumenici Concilii Tridentini* (Turin: Marietti, 1913). See for example Session XXI: *Decretum de reformatione*.

26. Dominican Cardinal Cajetan had already enunciated this perspective on Thomistic principles in his response to Luther at Augsburg in 1518. The merits of the saints are not in competition with either the satisfaction worked by Christ or his merits, which alone can be communicated to others. Christ's "satisfaction" is completely sufficient; but God wills that we also should collaborate in our salvation: "... appositio meritum sanctorum coronat divine dispositioni, non quod insufficienti sit christi satisfactio, sed ut plura sint in christi corpore mystico satisfactia. Sic enim docuit apostolus: 'Adimpleo,' inquit, 'ea quae desunt passioni Christi in carne mea pro corpore eius, quod est ecclesia [Col. 1:24].'" Thomas de Vio

Cajetan, "De Thesuro Indulgentiarum," in *Cajetan et Luther en 1518. Édition, traduction et commentaire des opuscules d'Augsbourg de Cajetan*, ed. Charles Morerod, OP (Freiburg, Switzerland: Éditions Universitaires, 1994), tome 1, q. 1, § 37 and q. 1, § 67 (cf. *In Summa Theol.* IIIa, 48, a. 5, n. 111).

27. *Catechismus ex Decreto Concilii Tridentini ad Parochos* (Rome, Typis S. Congregationis de Propaganda Fidei, 1858), Pars Prima, Article IV, ch. V, § 1, 30. In translating I have generally followed the English version in *The Catechism of the Council of Trent: published by Command of Pope Pius the Fifth* (Joseph F. Wagner, 1923), but I have revised the wording in a number of sections.

28. *Ibid.*, § 4, 31.

29. *Ibid.*

30. *Ibid.*, § 5, 31.

31. *Ibid.*

32. *Ibid.*, § 7, 32.

33. *Ibid.*, 33.

34. *Ibid.*, § 11, 34-35.

35. *Ibid.*, § 12, 35.

36. *Ibid.*, § 13, 35-36.

37. *Ibid.*, § 14, 36.

38. *Ibid.*, § 15-16.

39. *Ibid.*, Pars Secunda, ch. V, § 63-64, 183-84.

40. *Ibid.*, Pars Prima, Article IV, ch. V, § 36-37.

41. *Ibid.*, § 16, 37.

42. *Ibid.*, Article V, ch. VI, § 6, 39.

43. *Ibid.*, § 8, 40.

44. *Ibid.*, § 12, 42-43.

45. *Ibid.*, § 14, 43-44.

46. For an examination of the Catechism as a whole as a response to the positions of the Protestants, see Gerhard Bellingier, *Der Catechismus Romanus und die Reformation. Die Katechetische Antwort des Tridentiner Konzils auf die Haupt-Katechismen der Reformatoren. Konfessionskundliche und Kontroverstheologische Studien*, vol. 27 (Paderborn: Bonifatius-Druckerei, 1970).

47. *Catechismus ex Decreto Concilii Tridentini ad Parochos*, Pars Prima, ch. II, § 19, 17.

48. Some of the Reformers had taught the passivity of the human will before God's grace, which is irresistible—so, for example, the *Confessio Helvetica* II, ch. 9. The Council of Trent taught that humanity remains free before the offer of God's grace and can freely decide for or against its acceptance. See DS 814 and 815.

49. *Catechismus ex Decreto Concilii Tridentini ad Parochos*, Pars Secunda, ch. IV, § 76, 159.

50. *Ibid.*, § 78, 159.

51. Roberto Bellarmine [Robert Bellarmine], *Dottrina Cristiana Breve Perché Si Possa Imparare a Mente. Opera Omnia*, ed. Justinus Fèvre (Paris: Ludovicus Vivès, 1874), 12: 262.

52. Roberto Bellarmine [Robert Bellarmine], *Dichiarazione Più Copiosa della Dottrina Cristiana, Composta in Forma di Dialogo*, ch. III, *Opera Omnia*, 12: 288-89.

53. The most influential work on the nature of a courtly gentleman was of course *Il Cortegiano*, written by Baldassare Castiglione in 1528. Others that explicitly dealt with the notion of "honor" included Antonio Possevino, *Libro... nel qual s'insegna le cose pertinenti all'honore* (Vinegia, 1559); Andrea Alciati, *Duella* (Venetia, 1562); Fausto da Longiano, *Duella* (1551). These are cited by Milton Kirchman, *Mannerism and Imagination: A Reexamination of Sixteenth-Century Italian Aesthetic* (Salzburg: Institut für Anglistik und Amerikanistik Universität Salzburg, 1979), 52-78. *Libros de caballeria* were also common in Spain. It was of course against these that Cervantes directed his wit in *Don Quixote*.

54. *Ibid.*, cap. XVII, 330-31.

55. I have adopted the phrase "crisis of the Renaissance" from Arnold Hauser to designate together the artistic styles sometimes referred to as "Mannerist," "anti-Mannerist," and "Counter-Reformation."

56. "De invocatione, veneratione, et reliquiis sanctorum, et sacris imaginibus," *Canones et Decreta Sacrosancti Oecumenici Concilii Tridentini* (Turin: Marietti, 1913), Session XXV, 206-7.

57. Peter Camisius, *De Maria Virgine*, 712, quoted in Émile Mâle, *L'art religieux de la fin du XVI^e siècle, du XVII^e siècle et du XVIII^e siècle*, Étude sur l'iconographie après le Concile de Trente. Italie—France—Espagne—Flandres, 2nd ed. (Paris: Librairie Armand Colin, 1951), 22.

58. Further alterations of parts deemed offensive took place in 1566 under Pius V. Later, Clement VIII had to be dissuaded by the Academy of St. Luke from having the entire fresco destroyed, and El Greco reportedly offered to re-do the entire painting, and better.

59. Arnold Hauser, *Mannerism. The Crisis of the Renaissance and the Origin of Modern Art* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1986), 76.

60. Maselli, S.J., *Vita della beata Vergine* (Venice, 1610), 654, quoted in Mâle, *L'art religieux*, 8.

61. Mâle mentions Molanus: *De Hist. sanct. imag. et pict.*, lib. II; Cardinal Paleotti: *Discorso introno alle imagini sacre* (Bologna, 1582); Borghini: *Il Riposo* (Florence, 1584); and Gilio: *Dialogo degli errori dei pittori* (1564); *ibid.*, 5.

62. Nagel, *Michelangelo*, 195.

63. Vasari, *Lives* (Fra Angelico), quoted in Nagel, *Michelangelo*, 191.

64. Mâle, *La peinture religieuse*, 2-3.

65. Gauvin Alexander Bailey, *Between Renaissance and Baroque. Jesuit Art in Rome, 1565-1670* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 2003), 51.

66. *Ibid.*

67. Nagel, *Michelangelo*, 136. Nagel cites Titian's *Entombment* of the 1520s as an example. He points out that Titian's "religious" paintings are essentially in the genre of historical narrative; stylistically, they could as well have secular historical subjects.